

A Quantitative Content Analysis of In-Text Citations in Choral Pedagogy Books Published Between 1989–2009

Sarah K. Jones

Marion Independent School District, Marion, Iowa

Abstract

Content analyses of books published for professional development or for use in pre-professional university studies offer a perspective on the status of knowledge in a given field. This study assessed types and frequencies of in-text citations in choral pedagogy books ($N = 142$) published in North America between 1989–2009, with attention thereafter to (a) reference to research as indicated by research journal articles, theses, dissertations, research symposia papers, and unpublished research; and (b) a subgroup of books used in choral methods courses by professors from 22 institutions.

Among primary findings: (a) 75.35% of books examined contained 50 or fewer in-text citations, with 28.17% of all books examined containing no in-text citations; (b) with one exception and excluding citations of other books, the total frequency of non-research based citations significantly exceeded the total frequency of research based citations in the corpus of these books as a whole and in books used by surveyed professors for university methods courses; (c) however, frequency of in-text research citations was significantly greater in textbooks used by surveyed professors than in other choral pedagogy books examined; and (d) journals most frequently cited were *Choral Journal*, *Journal of Singing*, and *Music Educators Journal*. Results were discussed in terms of researched-based choral pedagogy, ways of knowing, status of choral pedagogy textbooks, and suggestions for future research.

Keywords

in-text citations, choral methods books, content analysis, choral pedagogy

Despite existing research in choral pedagogy, there have been recurrent claims of fragmentation and a gap between published research and its application by choral conductor-teachers in the choir rehearsal or classroom (Gonzo, 1973; Grant and Norris, 1998; Hylton, 1983; Turncott, 2003). Published choral pedagogy books afford one potential bridge between extant research and the practices of choral conductor-teachers. Whether used in formal coursework for the training of aspiring choral conductors or as a means of reference or rejuvenation for seasoned professionals, such books stand as representations of the field to anyone who comes in contact with them. According to Hassan and Becker (2007), “textbooks lay a crucial communicational role for disciplines by describing to their stakeholders and other disciplines the field’s body of knowledge” (p. 169). Content analysis of choral pedagogy textbooks, however, has remained comparatively limited (Anderson, 1953; Darrow, 1975; Daugherty, 2007; Hart, 1996; Koza, 1993, 1994; O’Toole, 1998).

Anderson (1953) compared 37 selected choral conducting texts written between 1800-1953 according to seven topics: qualities which make a successful choral conductor, organization of units, tone production, diction, interpretation, rehearsal procedure, and performance suggestions. Darrow (1965) analyzed books and articles concerned with choral training published between 1930-1962 to determine (a) what amount of agreement or disagreement existed between the texts, and (b) what patterns or relationships could be determined among the authors’ statements (p.9). In 1975, Darrow analyzed writings on the choral training of voices published in books (N = 42) and periodicals between 1930-1970 according to specific aspects of choral training: “1) tone quality; 2) breathing; 3) posture; 4) intonation; 5) range; 6) dynamics; and 7) diction” (Darrow, 1975, p. iii). Hart (1996) examined 43 English language choral conducting and secondary

music education texts published between 1939-1995 to determine the evolution of thought and recurrent ideas. Hawkins (2007) examined two choral classroom textbooks published in 1999 with respect to portrayed gender traits and sexual bias. Finally, Daugherty (2007) examined choral methods texts published between 1800-2007 to document the evolution and logic of acoustic claims for choir seating and formation plans.

Citation analysis, an established branch of bibliometrics, is a form of quantitative content analysis. Citation analysis can determine the extent of research-based content within a book. Rodriguez-Ruiz (2009) defines citation analysis as, “a type of quantitative research method used in information science to describe patterns of publication within a given field or body of literature” (p. 250). Citation analysis consists of counting and sorting according to category or variable the citations in a given text or set of texts. According to Radhakrishna, Eaton, Conroy and Jackson (1994), this procedure may be used to “characterize a field of study, define its boundaries, and explain how a discipline is interrelated with other fields of study” (p. 61).

Research findings, by law, require an attribution to the author and source when referenced. According to Rodriguez-Ruiz (2009), “the citation system is based on the rule of precedence of American law (Hopkins, 2005; Kademani & Kumar, 2002)” (p.252). Failure to acknowledge the original author and source is considered plagiarism. Citations can take a variety of forms, from parenthetical to footnote/endnote references, depending on the writing style chosen. Regardless of style, “standard procedures for citation ensure that references are accurate, complete, and useful to investigators and readers” (American Psychological Association, 2010, p.37). Citation analyses have been conducted to date with various journals, including music journals (e.g., Hamman & Lucas, 1998; Schmidt & Zdkinksi, 1993; Standley, 1984). No study to date,

however, examines choral pedagogy textbooks with respect to frequency of in-text citations or to frequency of research vs. non-research citations.

The purpose of this study was to assess types and frequencies of all in-text citations in English-language choral pedagogy books ($N = 142$) published in North America between 1989-2009, with particular attention thereafter to (a) reference to research as indicated by research journal articles, theses, dissertations, research symposia papers, and unpublished research; and (b) a subgroup of choral pedagogy books used by choral pedagogy professors from 22 institutions for choral methods courses during the 2009-2010 academic year. Three research questions guided this inquiry:

1. How many total in-text citations are there of books, research journal articles, theses, dissertations, research symposia papers, unpublished research, and various non-research media?

2. Do choral pedagogy textbooks selected by professors from 22 institutions have more or fewer in-text citations than non professor-selected books?

3. Are there significant differences between any of the preceding variables?

Definitions

The following definitions inform the design and procedures for this investigation:

Research

Research means a systematic investigation, including research development, testing and evaluation, designed to develop or contribute to generalizable knowledge. (United States Department of Health and Human Services, 2009, § 46.102d)

Generalizable Knowledge

“[Contributing to] generalizable knowledge means that (1) conclusions are drawn from particular instances, and (2) the information from the investigations is to be disseminated” (Brown University Research, n.d., para. 1).

Forms of Research

According to the National Association for Music Education (MENC, 1998), research may take the following forms:

1. Philosophical--Why: Formal examination through systematic logic and examination; Knowing, valuing, realizing meaning

2. Historical--What has been: Documented discussion of the past; Analysis, interpretation, preservation, discovery

3. Descriptive--What is: Quantitative and qualitative observation of people, places, settings, and things; Ex post facto description, evaluation, interpretation, verification

4. Experimental--Establishing cause and effect: Observation of outcomes based on controlled inquiry and structured situations; Development of theories over time; Isolation of cause and effect relationships, hypothesis testing, theory application (para. 10)

In-Text Citations

In-text citations may take the form of parenthetical references or footnotes/endnotes within the written text of a book. In-text citations do not include simple lists of recommended reading or source material not specifically referred to in the written text.

Research-Based Citations

A research-based citation, for purposes of this study, refers to an in-text citation of a research journal article, thesis, dissertation, research symposia paper, or unpublished research.

Research Journal

A research journal is a peer-reviewed periodical that publishes solely research-based information. Because the professional publication *Choral Journal* publishes both research and non-research articles per the definitions used for this study, cited articles from *Choral Journal* were examined individually to determine whether they were research or non-research articles.

Choral Pedagogy Books

According to Daugherty (2007), a choral pedagogy book is “Any published book that presents, recommends, or discusses practices or concepts for the edification and training of singing groups or their leaders” (p. 4). This study qualifies that definition by stipulating that a choral pedagogy book must include information about two or more of the following dimensions of choral music teaching and learning to be considered for analysis: (a) rehearsal methods - procedures and techniques for rehearsing a choir, including classroom management; (b) conducting technique – the effectual dexterity of the entire body’s ability to non-verbally communicate musical directions to others; (c) vocal pedagogy - the teaching of singing to both groups and individuals including information related to vocal technique, men’s and women’s changing voices, vocal health, and anatomy; (d) warm-ups – notated exercises and/or instruction of suggested physical and/or mental preparations for singing; (e) sight-singing – notated exercises and/or instruction of suggested methods for teaching students how to read music; (f) literature – choral repertoire and/or musicological information; or (g) philosophy - of music or music education.

Accordingly, this study does not include books focused on only one of these dimensions. For example, Ottoman’s book, *Music for Sight Singing* (2004), focuses solely on sight-singing

exercises; there is no additional information provided. Although this book may be an excellent tool for choral directors and singers, it does not conform to the definition used in this study and therefore would not be considered for analysis. However, *The Complete Choral Warm-Up Book* by Robinson and Althouse (1995), although primarily focused on warm-up exercises as the title suggests, also includes information related to vocal pedagogy, specifically posture and vowel formation. Because this book contains information from two dimensions of choral pedagogy, it is included in this study.

Delimitations

This investigation is limited to books published in North America between 1989-2009 that match the preceding definition of a choral pedagogy book. Every effort was exerted to identify all such books; however, there is no claim that every such book has been identified or examined. An assumption of this study is that the number of books identified and examined (N = 142) is sufficiently robust to represent a broad spectrum of choral pedagogy books published in North America during this time frame.

In-text citations of books were analyzed solely according to the cited book’s Library of Congress classification. Because books can contain both research and non-research material, and because books are too lengthy to examine individually in a study of the present scope, no effort was made to categorize book contents as either research or non-research oriented. Future studies may well wish to operate on a broader or narrower definition of a choral pedagogy book, include books published outside North America, analyze choral pedagogy books from different periods of time, or examine cited books individually, either in toto or by some form of stratified random sampling. Such variables, however, were not concerns of the present investigation.

Method

Textbooks

Appendix A contains the published (1989 - 2009) English language choral pedagogy textbooks ($N = 142$) used for this investigation. I identified these books through a variety of reference lists, databases, catalogues, and online searches.

Procedure

I and a colleague experienced in formal, academic writing used traditional quantitative content analysis procedures (Krippendorff, 1980) to identify, tabulate and analyze in-text citations in each of the books examined for this investigation. Every page of each textbook was scanned to locate in-text citations. In-text citations included parenthetical references, footnotes, or endnotes within the written text of a book. General reference lists, bibliographies, or suggested reading lists not related to a specific in-text citation were not included in this study.

We sorted and tallied identified in-text citations according to the following exhaustive and mutually exclusive categories: (a) non-research journal citation, (b) research journal citation, (c) dissertation citation, (d) thesis citation, (e) research symposium citation, (f) book, (g) unpublished research, (h) document (any paper artifact not included in the other categories, e.g., rehearsal plans), (i) personal communication (including email), (j) electronic media (excluding email), (k) presentations, (l) visual media, and (o) audio media. Inter-rater reliability, calculated as agreements divided by agreements + disagreements, was .97. We made no effort to categorize in-text citations of books as either research or non-research oriented, because (a) books can contain both research and non-research material and (b) the length of books prohibits, in a study such as the present

one, thorough examination of all the material contained therein.

Some professional journals occasionally disperse research-based information, but are not “primarily dedicated to the publication of research findings” (Hamann & Lucas, 1998, p. 410). Such publications include *Music Educators Journal*, *The Choral Journal*, *The Instrumentalist* and the *American String Teacher*. These periodicals “play an important part in the overall communication of ideas in our profession” (Hamann & Lucas, 1998, p. 410), but are not exclusively dedicated to reporting research. In the area of singing pedagogy, the *Journal of Singing* (formerly the *NATS Bulletin*) also plays such a role. For purposes of this study, a research journal is defined as a peer-reviewed periodical that solely publishes research-based information. Cited articles from *Choral Journal* were examined individually to determine whether they were research or non-research articles. Articles from *Music Educators Journal*, *The Instrumentalist*, *American String Teacher* and the *Journal of Singing* were identified as non-research for this study.

Survey

Appendix B contains the one-item survey employed to select a subgroup of choral pedagogy books used by professors in undergraduate choral methods courses. Survey recipients were initially targeted on a non-musical basis. In order to gain responses from a national sample of universities representing a variety of geographic locations and school sizes, I randomly selected four basketball conferences: the Big Ten, the Big 12, the ACC, and the PAC-10. I checked every official website of the schools in these conferences to determine that 35 institutions potentially offered a choral methods course (see Appendix C). I emailed the survey to all persons indicated as instructors of choral methods courses. If the instructor of

choral methods was not clear, I sent the survey to a choral, vocal, or other music instructor with the request that they identify the appropriate person to contact.

Results

Results are presented according to the research questions posed for this study. Research question three will be addressed in conjunction with research questions one and two. A predetermined alpha level of .05 was used to indicate statistical significance in reporting of results.

Research Question One: Overall In-Text Citation Types and Frequencies

This study identified 142 choral pedagogy textbooks (see Appendix A) according to the definitions used for this investigation. Identified books contained 9,637 in-text citations of any type. In-text citations per book ranged from 0 – 3,645 in-text citations ($M = 67.85$; $Mdn = 8$; $Mode = 0$). Over half (52.11%) of identified choral pedagogy textbooks each contained 10 or fewer citations of any kind. We found no in-text citations in 40 (28.17%) books. We found

Table 1. *Frequency Ranges of Total In-Text Citations in Examined Choral Methods Textbooks (N = 142)*

Range of Total Citations	Number of Textbooks
0	40
1-10	34
11-50	33
51-100	15
101-200	12
201-300	2
301-400	3
401-500	2
501-3645	1

from 1-10 in-text citations in 34 (23.94%) books. Table 1 presents the textbooks examined according to the frequency ranges of total in-text citations contained therein.

Thurman and Welch. The book *Bodymind & Voice: Foundations of Voice Education* by Thurman and Welch (2000) contained 37.82% ($n = 3645$) of all in-text citations identified in the 142 choral pedagogy textbooks consulted for this investigation. Because of its standing as a one-of-a-kind book among the textbooks identified for this study, and because overall results would be skewed by including this book

(even though it conformed to this study's definition of a choral pedagogy textbook), I present results from the Thurman and Welch book separately.

Of its 3,645 in-text citations, the Thurman and Welch book contained 2,189 (59.89%) citations of books, significantly more than any other category of in-text citation in this particular textbook, $\chi^2(7, 3645) = 10031.80$, $p < 0.0001$. The next highest frequency of Thurman and Welch in-text citations ($n = 1296$, 35.56 %) encompassed citations categorized as research citations from journals, theses, dissertations, research symposia, and unpublished research

(See Table 2). These in-text research citations contained in the Thurman and Welch book significantly outnumbered non-research in-text citations ($n = 160$, 4.39%) from journals and

other non-book media, $\chi^2(1, 1456) = 886.33, p < 0.0001$.

Table 2. Frequency and Percentage of In-Text Citations in Thurman and Welch (2000) According to Categories of Research, Non-research, and Books

Category	Frequency	Percentage
Research	1296	35.56
Research Journals	1192	32.70
Theses	10	0.27
Dissertations	31	0.85
Research Symposia	49	1.34
Unpublished Research	14	0.38
Non-Research	160	4.39
Non-Research Journals	115	3.16
Other Non-Research		
Personal Communications, including email	13	0.36
Documents	13	0.36
Presentations	10	0.27
Visual Media	9	0.25
Electronic Media, excluding email	0	0
Audio Media	0	0
Books	2189	59.89
Total	3645	100.00

Of all non-book, in-text research citations in Thurman and Welch, research journals ($n = 1192$, 32.70%) were cited significantly more than non-research journals ($n = 115$, 3.16%), dissertations ($n = 31$, 0.85%), and research symposia ($n = 49$, 1.34%), $\chi^2(3, 1387) = 2758.50, p < 0.0001$. The five journals cited

most frequently in *Bodymind & Voice* (Thurman & Welch, 2000) appear in Table 3. Each of these journals with the exception of *Journal of Singing* was found to be a research journal according to the definitions proposed for this study.

Table 3. *Five Research Journals Most Frequently Cited in Thurman and Welch (In-Text Citations)*

Journal	Citation Frequency	Percentage of All Journal In-Text Citations ($N = 1307$)
<i>Journal of Voice</i>	119	9.10
<i>Journal of Singing Science</i>	62	4.74
<i>Science</i>	46	3.52
<i>Folia Phoniatica</i>	37	2.83
<i>Journal of the Acoustical Society of America</i>	36	2.75

Excluding Thurman and Welch. The remaining 141 books examined contained 5,992 in-text citations. Table 4 shows the ten choral pedagogy textbooks with the highest frequency of in-text citations among books examined for this study.

Table 4. *Textbooks with Highest Frequency In-Text Citation Totals*

Text	Frequency	Percentage*
Phillips (2004)	473	7.89
Conlon (2009)	458	7.64
Spruce (2001)	367	6.12
Fredrickson (2004)	305	5.09
Ware (1998)	301	5.02
Phillips (1996)	261	4.36
Jordan & Holt (2008)	232	3.87
Chapman (2005)	177	2.95
Battisti (2007)	172	2.87
Collins (1999)	164	2.74
Total	2910	48.55

Note. * = Percentage is out of total in-text citations without Thurman and Welch ($N = 5992$).

The 141 books contained significantly more non-research in-text citations ($n = 1247$, 20.81%) than in-text citations from research sources ($n = 848$, 14.15%), $\chi^2(1, 2095) = 75.99$, $p < 0.0001$. Books ($n = 3897$, 65.04%) were cited significantly more frequently than any other in-text citation category, $\chi^2(7, 5992) =$

15844.33, $p < 0.0001$. Non-research citations from non-research journals, personal communications (including email), documents, presentations, visual media, electronic media (excluding email), and audio media (see Table 5) constituted the next highest frequency of in-text citations ($n = 1247$, 20.81%) in these textbooks ($N = 141$).

Table 5. Frequency and Percentage of In-Text Citations in All Textbooks (N = 141) Excluding Thurman and Welch (2000) According to Categories of Research, Non-Research, and Books

Category	Frequency	Percentage
Research	848	14.15
Research Journals	581	9.70
Theses	69	1.15
Dissertations	168	2.80
Research Symposia	22	0.37
Unpublished Research	8	0.03
Non-Research	1247	20.81
Non-Research Journals	724	12.08
Other Non-Research		
Documents	139	2.32
Audio Media	130	2.17
Visual Media	130	2.17
Electronic Media, excluding email	100	2.74
Personal Communications, including email	89	2.44
Presentations	47	1.29
Books	3897	65.04
Total	5992	100.00

As indicated by Table 5, there were significantly more in-text citations of non-research journals ($n = 724$, 12.08%) compared to research journals ($n = 581$, 9.70%), dissertations ($n = 168$, 2.80%), and research

symposia ($n = 22$, 0.37%), $\chi^2(3, 1495) = 887.46$, $p < 0.0001$. The five journals cited most frequently (exclusive of Thurman & Welch, 2000) appear in Table 6.

Table 6. Five Journals Most Frequently Cited in All Textbooks Excluding Thurman and Welch (In-Text Citations)

Journal	Citation Frequency	Percentage of All Journal In-Text Citations (N=1305)
<i>Choral Journal</i>	270	20.69
<i>Journal of Singing</i>	153	11.72
<i>Music Educators Journal</i>	125	9.58
<i>Journal of Research in Music Education</i>	100	7.66
<i>Journal of Voice</i>	43	3.30

As indicated by Table 6, *Choral Journal* was cited more frequently than any other journal ($n = 270$, 20.69% of total journal in-text citations). As previously mentioned, we examined all cited *Choral Journal* articles individually to determine whether they were research or non-research oriented according to this study's definitions. Among the 141 choral pedagogy textbooks, 72% ($n = 194$) of in-text citations of *Choral Journal* were non-research citations, while 28% ($n = 76$) of the in-text citations of *Choral Journal* were research citations. In the special case of *Choral Journal*, comparison of in-text citations of this journal between the 141 choral pedagogy books and the Thurman and Welch *Bodymind & Voice* indicated that Thurman and Welch cited *Choral Journal* 19 times. All but one of those citations pointed to research oriented *Choral Journal* articles.

Research Question Two:

Surveyed Professor-Selected Choral Pedagogy Books

Of 35 institutions to which a survey (see Appendix B) was sent, 28 responded, yielding a response rate of 80% (see Appendix C). Four of the responding schools did not offer an undergraduate choral methods class and two instructors reported not using a textbook. The remaining 22 institutions reported using 47 different textbooks in their respective choral methods courses; 36 of these textbooks fit the criteria for this study (see Appendix A).

The 36 books used by responding professors contained a total of 2,455 in-text citations. Per book in-text citation frequencies ranged from 0 – 3,645 citations, ($M = 169.64$; $Mdn = 24.5$; Modes = 0, 5). We found no in-text citations in 3 (8.33%) of these textbooks, and 1-10 in-text citations in 9 (25%) of these textbooks. Table 7 presents in descending order of frequency those textbooks used by more than one school.

Table 7. Textbooks Used in College/University Choral Methods Courses

Text	Schools*	In-text citations**
Phillips (2004)	14	473
Jordan & Holt (2008)	7	232
Brinson (2006)	3	60
Buchanan & Mehaffey (2005)		
Vol. 1	2	48
Vol. 2	2	59
Collins (1999)	2	165
Cooksey (1999)	2	42
Gumm (2006)	2	12
Jordan (2009)	2	57
Thurman & Welch (2000)	2	3645
Volk & McGill (2007)	2	0

Note. * = Out of 22 participating programs. ** = Out of total in-text citations with Thurman and Welch (2000) included N = 6100.

Two professors reported using *Bodymind & Voice* by Thurman and Welch (2000). As was done in reporting of overall results, the results from textbooks used by surveyed professors are presented here without Thurman and Welch (2000) data. As was the case with the 141 choral pedagogy textbooks (excluding Thurman & Welch), the 36 books used by professors contained significantly more citations of non-research material ($n = 619$, 25.21%) than citations of research-based material ($n = 461$, 18.78%), $\chi^2(1, 1080) = 23.12$, $p < 0.0001$.

Similarly, as was the case with the 141 choral pedagogy textbooks, frequencies of in-text citations of journals alone indicated significantly more citations of non-research journal articles ($n = 305$, 12.42%) than research journal articles ($n = 250$, 10.18%), $\chi^2(1, 555) = 5.45$, $p = 0.0196$, in the choral methods textbooks used by university professors. Table 8 presents total in-text citation frequencies in the textbooks used by surveyed professors.

Table 8. Frequency of In-Text Research Citations in Professors' Choral Methods Books Excluding Thurman and Welch (2000)

Category	Frequency	Percentage
Research	461	18.78
Research Journals	250	10.18
Dissertations	128	5.21
Theses	66	2.69
Research Symposia	10	0.41
Unpublished Research	7	0.29
Non-Research	619	25.21
Non-Research Journals	305	12.42
Other Non-Research		
Electronic Media, excluding email	79	3.22
Documents	69	2.81
Personal Communications, including email	66	2.69
Visual Media	67	2.73
Audio Media	17	0.69
Presentations	16	0.65
Books	1375	56.01
Total	2455	100.00

Table 9 presents in descending order the five most frequently cited journals in those choral pedagogy textbooks used by responding professors in choral methods courses.

Table 9. *Five Journals Most Frequently Cited in Textbooks Used by Surveyed Professors Excluding Thurman and Welch (In-Text Citations)*

Journal	Citation Frequency	Percentage of All Journal In-Text Citations ($N = 555$)
<i>Choral Journal</i>	124	22.34
<i>Music Educators Journal</i>	87	15.68
<i>Journal of Research in Music Education</i>	66	11.89
<i>Journal of Singing</i>	30	5.41
<i>Update</i>	28	5.05

I compared the in-text citation totals of professor-selected books ($N = 36$) with totals from non professor-selected books ($N = 106$) and totals from all books ($N = 141$). Table 10 presents these comparisons with the Thurman and Welch (2000) book excluded from both professor-selected and non professor-selected books.

Professor-selected textbooks evidenced: (a) a significantly higher frequency of dissertation and thesis research citations ($n = 194$) than non professor-selected textbooks ($n = 43$), $\chi^2(1, 237) = 52.27, p < 0.0001$; (b) a significantly higher frequency of research citations overall ($n = 461$) than non professor-selected textbooks ($n = 387$), $\chi^2(1, 848) = 6.46, p = 0.011$; (c) a significantly lower frequency of book citations ($n = 1375$) than non professor-selected textbooks ($n = 2522$), $\chi^2(1, 3897) = 171.96, p < 0.0001$; and (d) a higher percentage of non-research citations (25.21%) than non professor-selected textbooks (17.76%), though not significantly higher.

Because two professors reported use of the Thurman and Welch (2000) textbook, Table 11 presents comparisons with the Thurman and Welch (2000) text included in the professor-selected books but excluded from the non professor-selected books.

As with some other books examined in this study, the Thurman and Welch (2000) textbook was written specifically for use in course

settings, including university choral methods classes and also, in this particular case, Voice Care Network Impact Courses. In this particular comparison, professor-selected textbooks with the inclusion of the Thurman and Welch (2000) textbook differed primarily from non professor-selected textbooks with the Thurman and Welch (2000) text excluded in the following ways: (a) a significantly higher frequency of research citations overall ($n = 1757$) than non professor-selected textbooks ($n = 387$), $\chi^2(1, 2144) = 875.42, p < 0.0001$; (b) a significantly higher frequency of research journals ($n = 1442$) than non professor-selected textbooks ($n = 331$), $\chi^2(1, 1773) = 696.18, p < 0.0001$; (c) a significantly higher frequency of dissertations and theses ($n = 235$) than non professor-selected textbooks ($n = 43$), $\chi^2(1, 278) = 132.60, p < 0.0001$; (d) a significantly higher frequency of research symposia and unpublished research ($n = 80$) than non professor-selected textbooks ($n = 13$), $\chi^2(1, 93) = 48.27, p < 0.0001$; (e) a significantly higher frequency of book citations ($n = 3564$) than non professor-selected textbooks ($n = 2522$), $\chi^2(1, 6086) = 178.40, p < 0.0001$; and (f) a significantly higher percentage of non-research citations ($n = 779$) than non professor-selected textbooks ($n = 628$), $\chi^2(1, 1407) = 16.21, p < 0.0001$.

Table 10
 Comparison of In-Text Citations in Professor-Selected Choral Methods Textbooks (N = 35) with Non Professor-Selected Books (N = 106), Thurman and Welch Excluded

Category	Professor Books		Non Professor Books		All Books Combined	
	Frequency	Percentage	Frequency	Percentage	Frequency	Percentage
Research	461	18.78	387	10.94	848	14.15
Research Journals	250	10.18	331	9.36	581	9.70
Dissertations	128	5.21	40	1.13	168	2.80
Theses	66	2.69	3	0.08	69	1.15
Research Symposia	10	0.41	12	0.34	22	0.37
Unpublished Research	7	0.29	1	0.03	8	0.03
Non-research	619	25.21	628	17.76	1247	20.81
Non-research Journals	305	12.42	419	11.85	724	12.08
Other Non-research						
EM	79	3.22	21	0.59	100	1.67
Documents	69	2.81	68	1.92	139	2.32
Visual Media	67	2.73	63	1.78	130	2.17
PC	66	2.69	25	0.71	89	1.49
Audio Media	17	0.69	1	0.03	18	0.30
Presentations	16	0.65	31	0.88	47	0.78
Books	1375	56.01	2522	71.30	3897	65.04
TOTAL	2455	100.00	3537	100.00	5992	100.00

Table 11

Comparison of In-Text Citations in Professor-Selected Choral Methods Textbooks (N = 36), Thurman and Welch Included, with Non Professor-Selected Books (N = 106), Thurman and Welch Excluded

Category	Professor Books		Non Professor Books		All Books Combined	
	Frequency	Percentage	Frequency	Percentage	Frequency	Percentage
Research	1757	28.80	387	10.94	2144	22.25
Research Journals	1442	23.64	331	9.36	1773	18.40
Dissertations	159	2.61	40	1.13	79	0.82
Theses	76	1.20	3	0.08	199	2.06
Research Symposia	59	0.97	12	0.34	71	0.74
Unpublished Research	21	0.34	1	0.03	22	0.23
Non-research	779	12.77	628	17.76	1407	14.60
Non-research Journals	420	6.89	419	11.85	839	8.71
Other Non-research						
EM	79	1.30	21	0.59	100	2.74
Documents	82	1.34	68	1.92	150	4.12
Visual Media	76	1.25	63	1.78	139	3.81
PC	79	1.30	25	0.71	104	1.08
Audio Media	17	0.28	1	0.03	18	0.49
Presentations	26	0.43	31	0.88	57	1.56
Books	3564	58.43	2522	71.30	6086	63.15
TOTAL	6100	100.00	3537	100.00	9637	100.00

Analysis of choral pedagogy textbooks used in choral methods courses by selected professors participating in a survey indicated that these textbooks overall employed more in-text research citations than the examined choral pedagogy books at large published between 1989-2009. However, in-text research citations in books used in choral methods courses still accounted for less than 30% of total in-text citations.

Discussion

The primary findings of this investigation of in-text citations in 142 choral methods books published in North America between 1989-2009 are that (a) slightly more than half (52.11%) of choral methods books examined in this study contain ten or fewer in-text citations of any kind, while 75.35% of these texts contain 50 or fewer in-text citations and 28.17% of the books examined for this study contain no in-text citations of any kind; (b) in-text citations reference significantly more books than any other media; (c) in-text non-research citations occur significantly more than research citations among 141 books examined, (d) yet there is a significantly higher frequency of overall in-text research citations ($n = 461$) when comparing textbooks used in choral methods courses taught by responding professors and the remainder of choral pedagogy books examined for this study ($n = 387$). Moreover, (e) the three most frequently cited journals in both professor-selected and non professor-selected books are *Choral Journal*, *NATS Journal of Singing*, and *Music Educators Journal*; (f) 41.99% of all in-text journal citations reference *Choral Journal*, *NATS Journal of Singing*, and *Music Educators Journal*, primarily professional journals that publish both non-research and research material, but perhaps more of the former than the latter; and (g) one choral pedagogy book, *Bodymind & Voice* (Thurman & Welch, 2000), is so unlike the other choral pedagogy books published in

North America between 1989-2009 that its results had to be reported separately.

The in-text citations appearing in the choral pedagogy textbooks here examined most frequently referenced books. Books, of course, can contain research-derived information, non-research derived information, or various combinations of both. Books were cited 6,086 times, which made it impractical to examine each one individually. Thus, readers should be cautioned that the results of this study with respect to research-based and non research-based information are limited solely to citations of journals, papers, dissertations, theses, and a variety of other non-book media. It would not be fair to extrapolate these particular findings to assessments of the research or non-research content of entire choral pedagogy textbooks.

Hassan and Becker's (2007) observation that textbooks by and large do not always adhere to the same rigor of citation found in research articles is confirmed by the finding of the present investigation that 75.35% of examined books offered fewer than 50 in-text citations. However, to offer no in-text citations of any sort, as was the case with 28.17% of the choral pedagogy books examined in study, likely goes beyond considerations of rigor. This fact could reflect, of course, that all information conveyed by these citation-less books originated entirely with their authors. On the other hand, these results may offer at least a partial snapshot of the ways of knowing valued by particular choral pedagogy books. That is, to the extent that choral pedagogy books play a role both in reflecting the knowledge base of the profession and in passing that knowledge on to practitioners, such books serve an epistemological as well as educational function.

Epistemology has to do with the foundations and extent of knowledge; it asks, in effect, "How do we know what we know?" Classic epistemology defines knowledge as "justified, true belief" (Blackburn, 1999). For something to count as knowledge, by that definition, not only

must it be true, but also justified, i.e., tested by some logical process or analysis and not true simply because of luck. Citation, according to Ethics Code Standard 8.11 of the American Psychological Association (2010), is a means of giving credit “where credit is due” (p. 15). In-text citation, whether by footnote, endnote, or parenthetical reference, provides a means both to practice this obligation of scholarship and to provide readers with basic information necessary to evaluate on their own the particular source cited. In this small way, in-text citation has a direct relationship to epistemology, for it helps to answer the question of how an author knows what she knows or even how a profession knows what it knows, by pointing at least to the sources of that knowledge.

Kerlinger and Lee (1986) suggest there are multiple ways of claiming to know something, for instance: (a) knowing on the basis of authority or knowledge from respected testimony; (b) knowing on the basis of intuition, i.e., it feels right to me; (c) knowing because of tenacity, or the fact we have always believed something; and (d) knowing on the basis of data gathered and analyzed in a systematic, controlled, and objective fashion. This latter mode of knowing conforms largely to the definition of research used in the present study and it satisfies the justification condition for what counts as knowledge in classic epistemology.

From an epistemological standpoint, information gained through testimony, intuition, or even tenacity may possibly be true. Just as possibly, however, it may not be true. Likewise, there is no guarantee information gained through data-based research is true. At the very least, however, such information has been subjected to some form of systematic testing, often reviewed by others, in an attempt to justify it. In-text citations can assist readers in learning which way of knowing may be operative in particular instances. By contrast, choral pedagogy books that simply provide a general

bibliography or list of recommended books either at book’s end or the end of some chapters may not (a) entirely fulfill a scholarly obligation to give credit where credit is due or (b) assist readers to determine the source and thus particular way of knowing that may inform a statement or recommended procedure advanced by the author in a particular place in the book.

Koza (1994), Hart (1996), Daugherty (2007), and others who have examined aspects of choral pedagogy books over a period of time comment that, in general, most such books tend to look alike in terms of the information they convey, regardless of when the books were written. Inclusion of in-text citations would not per se address such perceived stagnancy in the knowledge base of the profession. However, expectation expressed by publishers, editors, and readers for authors to attend more diligently to some form of acknowledgment of sources and discernment between various kinds of information offered might contribute to gradual changes in the culture of choral pedagogy book authoring and publication.

A case in point is the Phillips (2004) book, *Directing the Choral Music Program*, the textbook most used in choral methods courses by responding professors. It contains extensive in-text citations even when it conveys content and information derived from non-research sources. Such citations enable readers to know, for instance, whether a particular assertion derives from one article or a host of studies, or from studies published in a research journal in contrast to articles published in a professional journal.

Certainly, there is a need for more research in choral pedagogy, a field where at least 141 of its textbooks, according to this study’s analysis of in-text citations, appear to rely as much, if not more, on testimony, intuition, and tenacity as on research-based knowledge. Still, it seems to this author that much research in the area of choral pedagogy has not yet made its way into the choral pedagogy textbooks used to educate

and rejuvenate practitioners. Data from this study suggest, for example, that after *Choral Journal*, *Music Educators Journal*, and the *NATS Journal of Singing*, percentages of in-text citations of research appearing in such flagship journals as the *Journal of Research in Music Education* and the *Journal of Voice* decrease remarkably. Even more, with the notable exception of the Thurman and Welch book (2000), research directly related to choral pedagogy appearing in flagship journals of other disciplines, e.g., the *Journal of the Acoustical Society of America* and the *Journal of the American Medical Association* is rarely cited, if at all.

Perhaps authors of the choral pedagogy textbooks here examined are simply unaware such research exists. Perhaps they are aware of it, but deem it tangential or immaterial. Future research might well inquire of choral pedagogy textbook authors on what basis they select material for citation in their books. Other studies might profitably examine as well the educational backgrounds, years of professional experience, and research publication records of choral pedagogy textbook authors.

This study focused on choral pedagogy books published over the last twenty years in North America. Future studies might explore whether or not differences in the frequency and character of in-text citations vary according to geography, e.g., compare texts published in North America, Europe Australia, Asia, and Africa. Future studies might also address such comparisons over time. Has the knowledge base of choral pedagogy, for instance, changed or expanded over time in ways comparable to the knowledge base of other professions such as medicine, or has it, as Koza (1994) asserts, indeed remained largely stagnant? Such matters merit further reflection and research, because choral conductor-teachers primarily work with people. Thus, there may be an ethical as well as scholarly obligation for choral pedagogy books to cite the types of knowledge on which they

rely, so that practitioners can make informed decisions about the various recommendations promulgated by these books. • IJRCS

Institutional Review Board Approval and Compliance

The author obtained approval from an appropriate Institutional Review Board to conduct this research in a manner that assured the ethical treatment of participants and the confidentiality of participant information.

Declaration of Conflicting Interests

The author declared no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

Funding

The author received no financial support for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

References

- American Psychological Association. (2010). *Publication manual of the American Psychological Association* (6th ed.). Washington D.C.: American Psychological Association.
- Anderson, R. L. (1953). *A comparative survey of the texts on choral conducting from 1800 (sic) to 1953*. Unpublished master's thesis, Texas Christian University.
- Blackburn, S. (1999). *Think: A compelling introduction to philosophy*. Oxford, U.K.: Oxford University Press.
- Brown University Research. (n.d.). *Research protections office: (Definition: Generalizable)*. Retrieved September 5, 2009, from http://research.brown.edu/rschadmin/hrpo_generalizable.php
- Darrow, G. F. (1965). *The nature of choral training as revealed through an analysis of thirty-three years of published writings* (Doctoral dissertation). Available from ProQuest Dissertations and Theses database. (AAT 6502523)
- Darrow, G. F. (1975). *Four decades of choral training*. Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow Press.
- Daugherty, J. (2007, August). *The evolution and logic of acoustic claims for choir seating and formation plans, 1800-2007*. Paper presented at the Pan-European Voice Conference, Groningen, The Netherlands.
- Gonzo, C. (1973). Research in choral music: a perspective. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, 33, 21-33.

- Grant, J., & Norris, C. (1998). Choral music education: A survey of research 1982-1995. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, 135, 21-59.
- Hamann, D. L. and Lucas, K.V. (1998). Establishing journal eminence in music education research. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 46(3), 405-413.
- Hart, S. R. (1996). *Evolution of thought and recurrent ideas in choral conducting books and secondary music education texts published from 1939 to 1995* (Doctoral dissertation). Available from ProQuest Dissertations and Theses database. (AAT 9628557)
- Hassan, N. R., & Becker, J. D. (2007). Uncovering conceptual gaps in introductory IS textbooks. *Journal of Information Systems Education*, 18(2), 169-182.
- Hawkins, P. J. (2007). What boys and girls learn through song: A content analysis of gender traits and sex bias in two choral classroom textbooks. *Research and Issues in Music Education*, 5(1).
- Hylton, J. (1983). A survey of choral education research: 1972-1981. *Council for Research in Music Education*, 76, 1-29.
- Kerlinger, F.N. & Lee, H.B. (1986). *Foundations of behavioral research*. Orlando, FL: Harcourt College Publishers.
- Koza, J. E. (1993). Big boys don't cry (or sing): Gender, misogyny, and homophobia in college choral methods texts. *The Quarterly Journal of Music Teaching and Learning*, 4(5), 48-64.
- Koza, J. E. (1994). Getting a word in edgewise: A feminist critique of choral methods texts. *The Quarterly Journal of Music Teaching and Learning*, 5(3), 68-77.
- Krippendorff, K. (1980). *Content analysis: An introduction to its methodology*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Music Educators National Conference. (1998). *A research agenda for music education: Thinking ahead*. Retrieved June 15, 2009, from <http://www.menc.org/resources/view/a-research-agenda-for-music-education-thinking-ahead>.
- O'Toole, P. (1998). A missing chapter from choral methods books: How choirs neglect girls. *Choral Journal*, 39(5), 9-32.
- Ottoman, R. W. (2004). *Music for sight singing*. Upper Saddle River: Prentice Hall.
- Radhakrishna, R. B., Eaton, D., Conroy, C., & Jackson, G. (1994). An empirical analysis of the literature cited in the *Journal of Agricultural Education*. *Journal of Agricultural Education*, 35(1), 61-65.
- Rodriguez-Ruiz, O. (2009). The citation indexes and the quantification of knowledge. *Journal of Educational Administration*, 47(2), 250-266.
- Schmidt, C. P., & Zdzinski, S. F. (1993). Cited quantitative research articles in music education research journals, 1975-1990: A content analysis of selected studies. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 41(1), 5-19.
- Standley, J. M. (1984). Productivity and eminence in music research. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 32(3), 149-157.
- Thurman, L., & Welch, G. (Eds.) (2000). *Bodymind & voice: Foundations of voice education* (Rev. ed.). Collegeville, Minnesota: The VoiceCare Network; Iowa City, IA: The National Center for Voice and Speech; Minneapolis, MN: Fairview Voice Center, London: Centre for Advanced Studies in Music Education.
- Turncott, A. (2003). *Choral music education: A survey of research 1996-2002* (Masters thesis). Tampa, FL: University of South Florida.
- United States Department of Health and Human Services (2009). § 46.102d. Retrieved June 15, 2009, from <http://www.hhs.gov/ohrp/humansubjects/guidance/45cfr46.html#46.102>.



Sarah K. Jones teaches in the Marion Independent School District, Marion, Iowa (USA) and has served as an adjunct instructor at the University of Iowa.

Appendix A

Choral Pedagogy Textbooks (N = 142) Examined

* = Textbooks used by choral methods instructors included in this study

Acker, M. (2007). *The passion-driven youth choir: A guide for directors of youth choirs with 10 to 100 members*. Nashville, TN: Abingdon.

*Albrecht, S. (2003). *The choral warm-up collection*. Van Nuys, CA: Alfred.

Althouse, J., & Robinson, R. (1995). *The complete choral warm-up book*. Van Nuys, CA: Alfred.

Alviani, H. (2007). *Voice works*. Van Nuys, CA: Alfred.

Ames, R. (2007). *Evoking sound the choral warm-up: Modal exercises*. Chicago, IL: GIA.

Banda, F. (2000). *Singing for beginners*. Van Nuys, CA: Alfred.

*Barham, T. (2001). *Strategies for teaching junior high and middle school male singers*. Santa Barbara, CA: Santa Barbara.

Barham, T., & Nelson, D. (1991). *The boy's changing voice: New solutions for today's choral teacher*. Van Nuys, CA: Alfred.

Bartle, J. A. (1998). *Lifeline for children's choir directors*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.

Bartle, J. A. (2003). *Sound advice: Becoming a better children's choir conductor*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.

Battisti, F. (2007). *On becoming a conductor: Lessons and meditations on the art of conducting*. Galesville, MD: Meredith Music.

Bertalot, J. (1994). *John Bertalot's immediately practical tips for choral directors*. Minneapolis, MN: Augsburg Fortress Publishers.

Bertalot, J. (2008). *Five wheels to successful sight singing*. Minneapolis, MN: Augsburg Fortress Publishers.

Boonshaft, P. L. (2009). *Teaching music with purpose*. Galesville, MD: Meredith Music Publications.

Bourne, P. (2009). *Inside the elementary chorus*. Dayton, OH: The Lorenz Corporation.

Bowyer, J. O. (2009). *Creative sightsinging*. Santa Barbara, CA: Santa Barbara.

Brewer, R. H. (1991). *Developing effective choral tone*. Montclair, CA: National Music Publishers.

*Brinson, B. A. (1996). *Choral music: Methods and materials*. New York, NY: Schirmer Books.

- *Buchanan, H. & Mehaffey, M. (2005). *Teaching music through performance in choir* (Vols. 1-2). Chicago, IL: GIA.
- *Bunch, M. & Vaughn, C. (2004). *The singing book*. New York, NY: W.W. Norton & Company.
- Burtis, H. (1992). *Sing on! Sing on! A guide to the life long enjoyment of the voice of singers and teachers of the vocal art*. Boston, MA: ECS Publishing.
- Caldwell, R., & Wall, J. (2001). *Excellence in singing: Multilevel teaching & multilevel learning* (Vol. 5). Greenbank, WA: Caldwell Pub Co.
- Carter, T. (2005). *Choral charisma: Singing with expression*. Santa Barbara, CA: Santa Barbara.
- Chapman, J. (2005). *Singing and teaching singing: A holistic approach to classical voice*. San Diego, CA: Plural Publishing.
- Choral survival kit for new teachers*. Milwaukee, WI: Hal Leonard.
- *Collins, D. (1999). *Teaching choral music* (2nd ed.). Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- *Conable, B. (2000). *The structures and movement of breathing*. Chicago, IL: GIA.
- *Conlon, J. (Ed.). (2009). *Wisdom, wit, and will: Women choral conductors on their art*. Chicago, IL: GIA.
- *Cooksey, J. (1999). *Working with adolescent voices*. St. Louis, MO: Concordia Publishing.
- Crocker, E. (2002). *Voice builders for better choirs*. Milwaukee, WI: Hal Leonard.
- Crocker, E., & Leavitt, J. (1998). *Essential musicianship: A comprehensive choral method, Teacher's Edition Book 1, 2, 3*. Milwaukee, WI: Hal Leonard.
- Crowther, D. S. (2003). *Key choral concepts: Teaching techniques and tools to help your choir sound great*. Bountiful, UT: Horizon Pub & Dist Inc.
- Daniel, D., Killian, J., & Rann, L. (1999). *Essential elements for choir teacher resource kit*. Milwaukee, WI: Hal Leonard.
- Dayme, M. (2009). *Dynamics of the singing voice* (5th ed.). New York, NY: Springer.
- de Brett, T. (1996). *Discover your voice*. Milwaukee, WI: Hal Leonard.
- *Decker, H. A., & Kirk, C.J. (1995). *Choral conducting: Focus on communication*. Prospect Heights, IL: Waveland Press, Inc.
- Deere, J. (2005). *Singing in the 20th century: A recollection of performance & pedagogy*. Bloomington, IN: AuthorHouse.
- Dehning, W. (2003). *Chorus confidential: Decoding the secrets of the choral art*. San Pedro, CA: Pavane Publishing.

- Demaree, R., & Moses, D. (1995). *The complete conductor*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- *Demorest, S. (2001). *Building choral excellence: Teaching sight-singing in the choral rehearsal*. New York, NY: Oxford.
- Dickau, D. C., & Petker, A. R. (1990). *Choral questions and answers*. San Pedro, CA: Pavane Publishing.
- Dilworth, R. (2006). *Choir builders: Fundamental vocal techniques for classroom and general use*. Milwaukee, WI: Hal Leonard.
- Donathan, D. F. (1995). *How does your choir grow?* Nashville, TN: Abingdon.
- Durrant, C. (2003). *Choral conducting: Philosophy and practice*. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Emerson, R. (2008). *Sing 6-7-8!* Milwaukee, WI: Hal Leonard.
- Emmons, S., & Constance, C. (2006). *Prescriptions for choral excellence*. New York, NY: Oxford.
- Fenton, W. C., & Johnson, S. O. (1990). *Choral musicianship: A director's guide to better singing*. Lebanon, IN: Houston Publishing, Inc.
- Fredrickson, S. (2004). *Popular choral handbook*. New Orleans, LA: Scott Music.
- *Freer, P. K. (2009a). *Getting started with middle school chorus*. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield Education with MENC.
- *Freer, P. K. (2009b). *TIPS: The first weeks of middle school chorus*. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield Education with MENC.
- Garretson, R. (1998). *Conducting choral music*. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- *Glenn, C., & Swan, H. (1991). *In quest of answers: Interviews with American choral conductors*. Chapel Hill, NC: Hinshaw Music.
- Gordon, L. (1989). *Choral directors rehearsal and performance guide*. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- *Gumm, A. (Ed.). (2006). *The choral director's cookbook: Insights and inspired recipes for beginners and experts*. Galesville, MD: Meredith Music Publications.
- Gumm, A. (2009). *Making more sense of how to sing*. Galesville, MD: Meredith Music Publications.
- Gumm, A. (2003). *Music teaching style*. Galesville, MD: Meredith Music Publications.
- Haaseman, F., & Jordon, J. M. (1991). *Group vocal technique*. Chapel Hill, NC: Hinshaw Music.
- Hall, L. O. (Ed.). (1997). *Strategies for teaching: Guide for music methods classes*. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield Education with MENC.
- Hamady, J. (2009). *The art of singing*. Milwaukee, WI: Hal Leonard.

- *Hoffer, C. (2001). *Teaching music in the secondary schools*. Florence, KY: Wadsworth Thomson Learning.
- *Horstmann, S. (2009). *Choral vocal technique*. Chicago, IL: GIA.
- Hunsberger, D., & Ernst, R. (1992). *The art of conducting*. (2nd ed.). New York, NY: McGraw-Hill, Inc.
- *Hylton, J. (1995). *Comprehensive choral music education*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Johnson, D. (1997). *Choral techniques: Beyond the basics*. San Diego, CA: Keil A. Kjos Music Co.
- Jordan, F., & Leck, H. (2009). *Creating artistry through choral excellence*. Milwaukee, WI: Hal Leonard.
- *Jordan, J. (2005). *Evoking sound: The choral warm-up: Method, procedures, and core vocal exercises*. Chicago, IL: GIA.
- *Jordan, J. (2009). *Evoking sound: Fundamentals of choral conducting and rehearsing* (2nd ed.). Chicago, IL: GIA.
- *Jordan, J. (2007). *Evoking sound: The choral rehearsal: (Vol. 1) Techniques and procedures*. Chicago, IL: GIA.
- *Jordan, J. (2008). *Evoking sound: The choral rehearsal: (Vol. 2) Inward bound, philosophy, and score preparation*. Chicago, IL: GIA.
- *Jordan, J. & Holt, M. (2008). *The school choral program: Philosophy, planning, organizing, and teaching*. Chicago, IL: GIA.
- *Jordan, J., & Mehaffey, M. (2001). *Choral ensemble intonation: Teacher's guide*. Chicago, IL: GIA.
- Jordan, J., & Wyers, G. (2009). *Music for conducting study: A companion to evoking sound: Fundamentals of choral conducting*. Chicago, IL: GIA.
- Jorgenson, N. S. (2003). *From the trenches: Real insights from real choral educators*. Dayton, OH: Heritage Music Press.
- Jothen, M. (2005). *Experiencing choral music (Beginning unison 2-part/3-part; Intermediate; Advanced)*. New York, NY: McGraw-Hill.
- Jothen, M. (2005). *Master strategies for choir*. Milwaukee, WI: Hal Leonard.
- Kohut, D., & Grant, J. (1990). *Learning to conduct and rehearse*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Lamble, W. (2004). *A handbook for beginning choral educators*. Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press.
- Lawrence, D., & Sanders, V. (1996). *A conductor's handbook: Vol. 2. A basic conductor's alphabet*. San Carlos, CA: Thomas House Publications.
- Maiello, A., & Bullock, J. (1996). *Conducting: A hands-on approach*. Van Nuys, CA: Alfred.
- Maiello, A. (2009). *Conducting nuances: Little things mean a lot*. Chicago, IL: GIA.

- Marquart, L. (2005). *The right way to sing*. New York, NY: Random House.
- McElheron, B. (2004). *Conducting technique: For beginners and professionals*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
- *McKinney, J. (1994). *The diagnosis and correction of vocal faults*. Nashville, TN: Genevox Music Group.
- McRae, S. (1991). *Directing the children's choir: A comprehensive resource*. New York, NY: Simon & Schuster.
- *MENC. (1991). *Teaching choral music: A course of study*. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield Education with MENC.
- MENC. (2002). *Spotlight on teaching chorus*. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield Education with MENC.
- Michelson, S. K. (1994). *Getting started with high school choir*. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield Education.
- Miller, R. (2004). *Solutions for singers*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
- Monahan, B. (2007). *The singer's companion: A guide to improving your voice and performance*. New York, NY: Limelight Editions.
- Nesheim, P. (1995). *Building beautiful voices: Directors edition*. Dayton, OH: The Lorenz Corporation.
- Neuen, D. (2002). *Choral concepts: A text for conductors*. Belmont, CA: Wadsworth.
- *Noble, W. H. (2005). *Creating the special world: A collection of lectures by Weston H. Noble*. Steven M. Demorest, (Ed.). Chicago, IL: GIA Publications.
- *O'Toole, P. (2003). *Shaping sound musicians*. Chicago, IL: GIA Publications.
- Pagel, R., & Specavek, L. (2004). *The choral director's guide to sanity and success*. Dayton, OH: Heritage Music Press.
- Paton, J. G. (2005). *Foundations in singing (8th ed.)*. New York, NY: McGraw-Hill.
- Peckham, A. (2008). *Vocal workouts for the contemporary singer*. Boston, MA: Berklee Press.
- Peckham, A. (2000). *The contemporary singer: Elements of vocal technique*. Boston, MA: Berklee Press.
- Pfautsch, L. (1994). *Choral therapy*. Nashville, TN: Abingdon.
- Pfeiler, C., & Jorgenson, N. (1995). *Things they never taught you in choral methods*. Milwaukee, WI: Hal Leonard.
- *Phillips, K. H. (2004). *Directing the choral music program*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
- *Phillips, K. H. (1996). *Teaching kids to sing*. New York, NY: Schirmer.
- *Rao, D. (1993). *We will sing: Choral music experience for classroom choirs*. Milwaukee, WI: Hal Leonard.

- Rao, D., & Perison, W. (2005). *Circle of sound*. Milwaukee, WI: Hal Leonard.
- Riggs, S., Carratello, J., & Miyake, R. J. (2008). *Singing for the stars: A complete program for training your voice*. Van Nuys, CA: Alfred.
- Roach, D. (1989). *Complete secondary choral music guide*. West Nyack, NY: Parker Publishing.
- Rogers, J. (2002). *The complete voice & speech workout*. Milwaukee, WI: Hal Leonard.
- Rose, B. (2004). *Contemporary singing techniques (Women's ed. & Men's ed.)*. Milwaukee, WI: Hal Leonard.
- Rundus, K. (2009). *Cantabile*. San Pedro, CA: Pavane Publishing.
- Sanders, V. (1993). *An conductor's handbook (Vol. 1): An exercise manual for individual or ensemble practice*. San Carlos, CA: Thomas House Publications.
- Schmidt, J. & Schmidt, H. (2007). *Basics of singing* (6th ed.). New York, NY: Schirmer.
- Seelig, T. (2005). *The perfect blend: Seriously fun vocal warm ups*. Nashville, TN: Shawnee Press.
- *Seeling, T. (2007). *The perfect rehearsal*. Nashville, TN: Shawnee Press.
- Seeling, T. (2009). *Quick fixes*. Nashville, TN: Shawnee Press.
- Sharp, T. W. (2005). *Precision conducting: Achieving choral blend and balance*. Dayton, OH: Roger Dean Publishing Company.
- Sharp, T. W. (2003). *Precision conducting: Seven disciplines for excellence in conducting*. Dayton, OH: The Lorenz Corporation.
- Sheppard, B. (2008). *The everything singing book with CD: From mastering breathing techniques to performing live – all you need to hit the right notes*. Cincinnati, OH: Adams Media.
- *Small, A., & Bowers, J. (1997). *Strategies for teaching elementary and middle-level chorus*. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield Education.
- Smith, B., & Sataloff, R. T. (2005). *Choral pedagogy* (2nd ed.). San Diego, CA: Plural Publishing.
- Snyder, A. (2007). *Sing on sight* (Teacher's ed.). Milwaukee, WI: Hal Leonard.
- Spruce, G. (2001). *Aspects of teaching secondary music: Perspectives on practice*. New York, NY: RoutledgeFalmer.
- Stanton, R. (2000). *Steps to singing for voice classes*. Long Grove, IL: Waveland Press.
- Stultz, M. (2007/2008). *Innocent sounds* (Book 2). Fenton, MO: MorningStar Music.
- Swears, L. (1989). *Teaching the elementary school chorus*. West Nyack, NY: Parker Publishing.
- Swiggum, R. (1998). *Strategies for teaching high school chorus: Your key to implementing the national standards*

for music education. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield Education with MENC.

Telfer, N. (2003). *Singing high pitches with ease.* San Diego, CA: Kjos.

Telfer, N. (2000). *Singing in tune.* San Diego, CA: Kjos.

Telfer, N. (2005). *Successful performing (Book 1, Conductor's ed.).* San Diego, CA: Kjos.

Telfer, N. (2005). *Successful sight-singing (Book 1-2, Teacher's ed.).* San Diego, CA: Kjos.

Telfer, N. (2005). *Successful warmups (Book 1-2, Conductor's ed.).* San Diego, CA: Kjos.

Thompson, E. E. (2000). *Fire for the choir: Motivation for choir members.* Lima, OH: CSS Pub. Co.

*Thurman, L., & Welch, G. (2000). *Bodymind & voice: Foundations of voice education (Vols. 1-3).* Iowa City, IA: National Center for Voice & Speech.

*Volk, E., & McGill, S. (2007). *Beyond singing: Blueprint for the exceptional choral program.* Milwaukee, WI: Hal Leonard.

Ware, C. (1998). *Basics of vocal pedagogy.* New York, NY: McGraw-Hill.

Ware, C. (2007). *Adventures in singing (4th ed.).* New York, NY: McGraw-Hill.

Webb, G. V. (Ed.). (1993). *Up front! Becoming the complete choral conductor.* Boston, MA: ECS Publishing.

Willets, S. (2000). *Beyond the downbeat: Choral rehearsal skills and techniques.* Nashville, TN: Abingdon.

Wormhoudt, P. S. (2001). *With a song in my psyche: On the psychology of singing and teaching singing.* Bloomington, IN: Xilbris.

Yarrington, J. (1990). *Building the youth choir: Training and motivating teenage singers.* Minneapolis, MN: Augsburg Fortress.

Yarrington, J. (2004). *Somebody's got my hymnal.* Nashville, TN: Abingdon.

Yarrington, J. (2008). *Have we had this conversation?* Dayton, OH: The Lorenz Corporation.

Yarrington, J., & Smity, G. (Ed.). (1997). *Somebody's got my robe: Lighthearted look at choir directing.* Nashville, TN: Abingdon.

Appendix B

Survey

Dear Dr. _____,

As part of my study of Choral Pedagogy texts I was hoping you could quickly tell me what textbook(s) are used in your undergraduate choral methods courses.

Undergraduate choral methods = the course before student teaching that prepares students to work with choirs.

Textbooks = printed, published books

Simply state the title(s); it is not necessary to include author or publisher.
Thank you so much for your valuable time.

Sincerely,

Appendix C

Survey Data

School	Conference	Music Ed Program	Book(s) Used
U of Illinois	Big Ten	Yes	Bunch & Vaughn (2004), Jordan & Holt (2008)
Indiana U	Big Ten	Yes	Ward-Steinman (2010)
U of Iowa	Big Ten	Yes	Phillips (2004), Thurman & Welch (2000), Jordan (2009), Gumm (2006)
U of Michigan	Big Ten	Yes	Phillips (2004), Madsen (1993), Caldwell et al. (2005), Grunow & Fargo (1985)
Michigan State	Big Ten	Yes	None
U of Minnesota	Big Ten	Yes	Phillips (2004), Phillips (1996), Jordan & Mehaffey (2001), Cooksey (1999)
Northwestern U	Big Ten	Yes	Phillips (2004), Small & Bowers (1997), Monath (2006), Barham (2001), Freer (2009) Getting Started..., Freer (2009) TIPS: The First Weeks...
Pennsylvania State U	Big Ten	Yes	Jordan & Holt (2008), Rao (1993), Hoffer (2001)
Purdue U	Big Ten	None	
U of Wisconsin	Big Ten	Yes	Decker & Kirk (1995)
Ohio State	Big Ten	Yes	Phillips (2004), Noble (2005)
Baylor U	Big 12	Yes	None
U of Colorado	Big 12	Yes	Brinson (1996)
Iowa State U	Big 12	No Reply	
U of Kansas	Big 12	Yes	Colton et al. (2005), Gumm (2006), McKinney (1994), Phillips (2004), Wall (1989), Thurman & Welch (2000)
Kansas State U	Big 12	Yes	O'Toole (2003), Phillips (2004), Glenn & Swan (1991)
U of Missouri	Big 12	No Reply	
U of Nebraska	Big 12	Yes	Holt & Jordan (2008), Buchanan & Mehaffey (2005) Vols. 1-2, Jordan (2005), Jordan (2007), Phillips (2004), Brinson (1996), Hylton (1995)
U of Oklahoma	Big 12	No Reply	
Oklahoma State	Big 12	Yes	Phillips (2004)
U of Texas	Big 12	Yes	Jordan & Holt (2008), McClung (2008), Volk & McGill (2007), Collins (1999)
Texas A&M U	Big 12	None	
Texas Tech U	Big 12	Yes	Jordan & Holt (2008), Phillips (2004), Jordan (2007), Jordan (2008), O'Toole (2003), Conable (2000), Conlon (2009), Demorest (2003), Horstmann (2009), Jordan (2009), Jordan (2005), Jordan (2004), Volk & McGill (2007), Schrock (2009)
Boston College	ACC	None	
Clemson U	ACC	None	

Duke U	ACC	None	
Florida State U	ACC	Yes	Jordan & Holt (2008)
Georgia Institute of Technology	ACC	None	
U of Maryland	ACC	Yes	MENC (1991), Cooksey (1999)
U of Miami	ACC	Yes	Phillips (2004), Ehmann et al. (1982), Seelig (2005)
U of North Carolina	ACC	None	
North Carolina State U	ACC	None	
U of Virginia	ACC	None	
Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State U	ACC	Yes	Phillips (2004)
Wake Forest U	ACC	None	
University of Arizona	PAC-10	Yes	Phillips (2004), Albrecht (2003)
Arizona State University	PAC-10	No Reply	
University of California, Berkeley	PAC-10	None	
University of Oregon	PAC-10	No Reply	
Oregon State University	PAC-10	No Reply	
Stanford University	PAC-10	None	
University of California, Los Angeles	PAC-10	No Reply	
University of Southern California	PAC-10	None	
University of Washington	PAC-10	Yes	None
Washington State University	PAC-10	Yes	Brinson (1996)